

# **BCI Competition III - Organizers**

[Berlin]

**Benjamin Blankertz, Guido Dornhege, Klaus-Robert Müller**

[Albany]

**Gerwin Schalk, Dean Krusienski, Jonathan R. Wolpaw**

[Graz]

**Alois Schlögl, Bernhard Graimann, Gert Pfurtscheller**

[Martigny]

**Silvia Chiappa, José del R. Millán**

[Tübingen]

**Michael Schröder, Thilo Hinterberger, Thomas Navin Lal,  
Guido Widman, Niels Birbaumer**

# Data Set I – Tübingen

»motor imagery in ECoG recordings, session-to-session transfer«

Perf: **accuracy** [%], Chance: 50%, submissions: 27

#.	contributor	acc	research lab	co-contributors
1.	Qingguo Wei	<b>91</b>	Tsinghua University, Beijing	Fei Meng, Yijun Wang, Shangkai Gao
2.	Paul Hammon	<b>87</b>	University of California, San Diego	
3.	Michal Sapinski	<b>86</b>	No affiliation, Poland	
3.	Mao Dawei	<b>86</b>	Zhejiang University, P.R.C.	Ke Dagan, Xie Mingqiang, Ding Jichang, Zheng Kening, Zhou Jie, Murat
3.	Alexander D'yakonov	<b>86</b>	Moscow State University	
3.	Liu Yang	<b>86</b>	National University of Defense Technology Changsha, P.R.C.	Hu Dewen, Zhou Zongtan, Zang Guohua
7.	Florian Knoll	<b>84</b>	TU Graz	Alois Schloegl, Martin Hieden, Carmen Vidaurre, Bernhard Graimann
7.	Zhou Zongtan	<b>84</b>	National University of Defense Technology Changsha, P.R.C.	Liu Yang, Hu Dewen
9.	Jianzhao Qin	<b>83</b>	South China University of Technology, China and Institute for Infocomm Research, Singapore	Yuanqing Li
10.	Matthias Krauledat	<b>82</b>	Fraunhofer FIRST, Berlin	

11.	Kiyoung Yang	<b>81</b>	University of Southern California	
11.	Martin Hieden	<b>81</b>	TU Graz, Austria	Florian Knoll, Alois Schloegl, Carmen Vidaurre, Bernhard Graitman
13.	Archis Gore	<b>79</b>	Fergusson College, Pune	
13.	Elly Gysels	<b>79</b>	CSEM, Neuchatel	
15.	Xiaomei Pei	<b>69</b>	Xi'an Jiaotong University, P.R.C.	Guangyu Bin
16.	Ehsan Arbabi	<b>67</b>	Sharif University of Technology, Tehran	Mohammad Bagher Shamsollahi
17.	Florian Popescu	<b>66</b>	Fraunhofer FIRST, Berlin	
18.	Hyunjin Yoon	<b>65</b>	University of Southern California	
18.	Guido Nolte	<b>65</b>	Fraunhofer FIRST	
20.	Timothy Uy	<b>60</b>	University of California, Irvine (?)	
21.	Wit Jakuczun	<b>59</b>	Warsaw University of Technology	
22.	Ken Wong	<b>58</b>	Stanford University	
23.	Xi-Chen Sun	<b>54</b>	Peking University	Jufu Feng, Lianwen Wu, Qiansheng Cheng
24.	Nanying Liang	<b>50</b>	Nanyang Technological University, Singapore	
25.	Bin An	<b>48</b>	University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei	Yan Ning, Qiang Chen, Zhaohui Jiang, Huanqing Feng
26.	Miharu Nishino	<b>44</b>	Univ. of Tokyo	Osamu Fukayama, Takashi Sato
27.	Yan Ning	<b>22</b>	University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei	Bin An, Qiang Chen, Zhaohui Jiang, Huanqing Feng

## Data Set II – Albany

### »P300 speller paradigm«

Perf: **accuracy** [%] using all 15 repetitions, chance: 2.8%, 10 submissions

#.	contributor	acc	acc5	research lab	co-contributors
1.	Alain Rokotomamonj	<b>96.5</b>	73.5	PSI CNRS FRE-2645, INSA de Rouen, France	V. Guigue
2.	Li Yandong	<b>90.5</b>	55.0	Department of Automation Department of Biomedical Engineering, Tsinghua University, China	Gao Xiaorong, Ma Zhongwei, Lin Zhonglin, Lu Wenkai, Hong Bo
3.	Zhou Zongtan	<b>90.0</b>	59.5	Department of Automatic Control, National University of Defense Technology, China	Liu Yang, Hu Dewen, Zang Guohu
4.	Ulrich Hoffmann	<b>89.5</b>	53.0	Signal Processing Institute, Ecole Polytechnique Federale de Lausanne (EPFL), Switzerland	
5.	Lin Zhonglin	<b>87.5</b>	57.5	Department of Automation, Tsinghua University, China	Zhang Changshui, Gao Xiaorong, Zhou Jieyun
6.	Renzhi Lu	<b>83.0</b>	54.5	Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, NY	
7.	Gerardo Gentiletti	<b>78.5</b>	46.0	Neuroimaging Laboratory, Department of Electrical Engineering, Universidad Autonoma Metropolitana Iztapalapa, Mexico City	Oscar Suarez, Veronica Banelos

8.	Gautam Kunapuli	<b>75.0</b>	34.0	Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, NY	
9.	Qi Hongzhi	<b>33.5</b>	27.5	Tianjin University, China	Zhang Qian, Wang Zhen, Wan Baikun
10.	Kiyoung Yang	<b>7.5</b>	7.0	University of Southern California	Cyrus Shahabi, Hyunjin Yoon

## Data Set IIIa – Graz

»motor imagery, multi-class, good vs. fair subject performance«

Perf: **kappa** (scaled accuracy with *#classes*), chance: 0, submissions: 3

#.	contributor	kappa	K3	K6	L1	research lab	co-contributors
1.	Cuntai Guan	<b>0.79</b>	0.82	0.76	0.80	Neural Signal Processing Lab Institute for Infocomm Research, Singapore	Haihong Zhang, Yuanqin Li
2.	Gao Xiaorong	<b>0.69</b>	0.90	0.43	0.71	Tsinghua University, Beijing, China	Wu Wei, Wang Ruiping, Yang Fusheng
3.	Jeremy Hill	<b>0.63</b>	0.95	0.41	0.52	Max Planck Institute for Biological Cybernetics, Tuebingen and Tuebingen University	Michael Schroeder

## Data Set IIIb – Graz

»motor imagery with non-stationarity problem«

Perf: **MI/t** (max. steepness of mutual information), chance: 0, submissions: 7

#.	contributor	MI/t	O3	S4	X11	research lab	co-contributors
1.	S. Lemm	<b>0.32</b>	0.17	0.44	0.35	Fraunhofer (FIRST) IDA, Berlin Germany	
2.	O. Burmeister	<b>0.25</b>	0.16	0.42	0.17	Forschungszentrum Karlsruhe, Germany	M. Reischl, R. Mikut
3.	Xiaomei Pei	<b>0.14</b>	0.20	0.09	0.12	Institute of Biomedical Engineering of Xian Jiaotong University, Xian, China	Guangyu Bin
4.	S. Parini	<b>0.12</b>	0.12	0.12	0.12	Politecnico di Milano, Italy	L. Piccini, L. Maggi, G. Panfili, G. Andreoni
5.	D. Coyle	<b>0.12</b>	0.10	0.15	0.09	University of Ulster, Northern Ireland	G. Prasad, M. McGinnity
6.	Dezhong Yao	<b>0.11</b>	0.12	0.15	0.06	University of Electronic Science and Technology of China (UESTC) Chengdu, China	Yu Yin, Xiang Liao
7.	K. Tavakolian	<b>0.05</b>	0.07	0.02	0.05	University of Northern British Columbia, Canada	S. Rezaei

## Data Set IVa – Berlin

»motor imagery, small training sets«

Perf: overall **accuracy** [%], chance: 50%, submissions: 14

#.	contributor	acc	aa	al	av	aw	ay	research lab	co-contributors
1.	Yijun Wang	<b>94.2</b>	96	100	81	100	98	Tsinghua University, Beijing	Han Yuan, Dan Zhang, Xiaorong Gao, Zhi-guang Zhang, Shang-kai Gao
2.	Yuanqing Li	<b>85.1</b>	89	98	76	92	81	Institute for Infocomm Research, Singapore	Xiaoyuan Zhu, Cuntai Guan
3.	Liu Yang	<b>83.5</b>	82	95	70	88	88	National University of Defense Technology, Changsha, Hunan	Zhou Zongtan, Zang Guohua, Hu Dewen
4.	Zhou Zongtan	<b>72.6</b>	84	100	63	51	88	National University of Defense Technology, Changsha, Hunan	Hu Dewen, Liu Yang
5.	Michael Bensch	<b>69.2</b>	73	96	70	80	51	University of Tuebingen and Max Planck Institute for Biological Cybernetics	Jeremy Hill
6.	Lehembre Remy	<b>68.6</b>	83	91	50	88	54	Université Catholique de Louvain-la-Neuve (UCL-Belgium)	Cedric Simon



7.	Elly Gysels	<b>67.9</b>	70	96	64	70	62	Swiss Center for Electronics and Microtechnology, Neuchatel, Switzerland	
8.	Carmen Viduarre	<b>64.0</b>	66	93	67	68	50	Dp IEE, State University of Navarra (UPNA) / Institut for Human-Computer Interfaces/BCI Lab, TU Graz	Alois Schloegl, Martin Hieden, Florian Knoll, Rafael Cabeza
9.	Le Song	<b>63.7</b>	66	100	63	64	54	NICTA and School of Information Technology	
10.	Ehsan Arbabi	<b>62.7</b>	70	95	56	64	56	Electrical Engineering Department, Sharif University of Technology, Tehran, Iran	Emad Fatemizadeh
11.	Cyrus Shahabi	<b>59.5</b>	57	77	58	64	54	University of Southern California	Kiyoung Yang, Hyunjin Yoon
12.	Kiyoung Yang	<b>53.9</b>	53	86	61	52	44	University of Southern California	Hyunjin Yoon, Cyrus Shahabi
13.	Wang Feng	<b>51.9</b>	51	54	55	56	46	Southeast University, Nanjing	Liu Jianmin, Gong Kainan, Wang Xiaonan, Tang Liyan
14.	Hyunjin Yoon	<b>51.2</b>	50	68	53	53	46	University of Southern California	Kiyoung Yang, Cyrus Shahabi

## Data Set IVc – Berlin

»motor imagery, rest class in test, but not in training data«

Perf: mean square error (mse), constant 0 output:  $0.\bar{6}$ , submissions: 7

#.	contributor	mse	research lab	co-contributors
1.	Dan Zhang	<b>0.30</b>	Department of Biomedical Engineering, Tsinghua University, Beijing	Yijun Wang
2.	Liu Yang	<b>0.59</b>	National University of Defense Technology, Changsha, Hunan	Hu Dewen, Zhou Zongtan, Zang Guohua
3.	Zhou Zongtan	<b>0.60</b>	National University of Defense Technology, Changsha, Hunan	Hu Dewen, Liu Yang
4.	Bo Hong	<b>0.67</b>	Johns Hopkins School of Medicine	Soumyadipta Acharya, Nitish V. Thakor
5.	Kiyoung Yang	<b>0.74</b>	Information Laboratory, University of Southern California	Hyunjin Yoon, Cyrus Shahabi
6.	Cyrus Shahabi	<b>0.88</b>	Information Laboratory, University of Southern California	Kiyoung Yang, Hyunjin Yoon
7.	Hyunjin Yoon	<b>1.33</b>	Information Laboratory, University of Southern California	Kiyoung Yang, Cyrus Shahabi

## Data Set V – Martigny

»mental imagery, multi-class, uncued classifier application«

Perf: **accuracy** [%], chance: 33.3%, submissions: 19

#.	contributor	psd	acc	s1	s2	s3	research lab	co-contributors
1.	Ferran Galan	y	<b>68.7</b>	80	70	56	University of Barcelona	Francesc Oliva, Joan Guardia
2.	Xiang Liao	y	<b>68.5</b>	78	72	56	University of Electronic Science and Technology of China (UESTC)	Yu Yin, Dezhong Yao
3.	Walter	y	<b>65.9</b>	78	66	53	???	
4.	Xiaomei Pei	y	<b>65.7</b>	76	69	52	Institute of Biomedical Engineering of Xi'an Jiaotong University	Guangyu Bin, Chongxun Zheng
5.	Irene Sturm	y	<b>64.9</b>	78	64	53	Fraunhofer FIRST (IDA), Berlin	Guido Dornhege
6.	Stephan Uray	y	<b>64.6</b>	81	73	40	TU Graz	
7.	Julien Kronegg	y	<b>64.0</b>	76	65	51	University of Geneva	Douglas Rofes
8.	John Q. Gan	y	<b>63.9</b>	77	64	50	University of Essex, Colchester	Louis C.S. Tsui
9.	Shiliang Sun	n	<b>62.8</b>	74	62	52	Tsinghua University, Beijing	Changshui Zhang, Jie Pan
10.	J. I. Serrano	y	<b>62.6</b>	76	62	50	Instituto de Automatica Industrial. CSIC. Madrid	
11.	Changshui Zhang	y	<b>60.5</b>	72	59	50	Tsinghua University, Beijing	Shiliang Sun, Feiping Nie

12.	Douglas Rofes	y	<b>59.8</b>	73	60	47	University of Geneva	
13.	Alois Schloegl	n	<b>52.7</b>	69	57	32	TU Graz	Carmen Vidaurre
14.	Ehsan Arbabi	n	<b>50.2</b>	55	52	44	Sharif University of Technology	Mohammad B. Shamsollahi
15.	Remy Lehembre	y	<b>50.2</b>	73	46	32	Universite Catholique de Louvain-la-Neuve (UCL-Belgium)	Simon Cedric
16.	Georgios Lappas	y	<b>45.7</b>	72	34	31	Technological Educational Institution (TEI) of Western Macedonia, University of Hertfordshire	Andreas Albrecht
17.	M. B. Shamsollahi	y	<b>45.0</b>	71	33	31	Sharif University of Technology	Ehsan Arbabi
18.	Ikaro Silva	y	<b>30.7</b>	39	27	26	???	
19.	Ali Salehi	n	<b>28.0</b>	27	33	25	???	
20.	Ikaro Silva2	y	<b>14.2</b>	6	11	26	???	